I. Open/Public Session Call to Order.

Chair Jonathan Alexander called the meeting to order.
Secretary Akio Tanaka called the roll.

A. Roll call and establishment of quorum

**Present:** Grace Aaron, Jonathan Alexander, David Beaton, Jim Brown, Bill Campisi, Adriana Casenave, Bill Crosier, *Kathryn Davis, Benito Diaz, Rhonda Garner, Jan Goodman, Sabrina Jacobs, Ken Laufer, Robert Mark, Cerene Roberts, Mansoor Sabbagh, Nancy Sorden, Alex Steinberg, Akio Tanaka, Themba Tshibanda, Andrea Turner, Maskeelah-Myrtle Washington

**Absent:** *Arrived after the roll call.

B. Identify Timekeepers – Mansoor Sabbagh

C. Excused absences – None

Point of Order by Cerene Roberts

"Your statement was that on January 26 the PNB voted to accept a "quote" Alternate Tally and that is not the case. One, there is no such thing as Alternate Tally; two, 2016 PNB voted on the issue of Affiliate Directors as Bylaws required. 2017 PNB does not have an opinion, and it is completely ridiculous for you guys to pretend that you can bring up some motion about an Alternate Tally to undo what the Board lawfully did based on the Bylaws."

Chair rules against the Point of Order. [PNB voted to accept the Alternate Tally at the 2-10-17 meeting.]

Challenge to the Chair by Nancy Sorden, seconded by Adriana Casenave

Vote to uphold the Chair:

**Yes:** Grace Aaron, Jonathan Alexander, Kathryn Davis, Rhonda Garner, Jan Goodman, Sabrina Jacobs, Ken Laufer, Robert Mark, Mansoor Sabbagh, Alex Steinberg, Akio Tanaka

**No:** Jim Brown, Adriana Casenave, Benito Diaz, Cerene Roberts, Nancy Sorden, Themba Tshibanda, Maskeelah-Myrtle Washington

**Abstain:** Bill Campisi, Bill Crosier

**Present Not Voting:** David Beaton, Andrea Turner,
[11Y- 7N- 2A- 2PNV: Chair’s ruling sustained]

Point of Order by Adriana Casenave:

"We in a decision that made not yet, we allowed the people that replaced illegally another Director to vote, including himself. The other question is, was it at the beginning clear that we separated the two votes. Why Sharon Brown was not allowed to vote and somebody that was replacement. We said we would talk about the issues, but you say so. Now we suddenly that was done. No Sir, that is what you said more than once about the issue. You said that we would separate both issues. Now that doesn't count anymore?"

Chair rules against the Point of Order. [Jaime Gomez, Chair of KPFA LSB, reported to the PNB that KPFK LSB voted that Sharon Brown had effectively resigned from the LSB, and that KPFA Delegates Assembly elected Mansoor Sabbagh as Director.]

Challenge to the Chair by Nancy Sorden, seconded by Adriana Casenave.

Vote to uphold the Chair:
Yes: Grace Aaron, Jonathan Alexander, David Beaton, Kathryn Davis, Rhonda Garner, Jan Goodman, Ken Laufer, Robert Mark, Mansoor Sabbagh, Alex Steinberg
No: Jim Brown, Bill Campisi, Adriana Casenave, Benito Diaz, Sabrina Jacobs, Cerene Roberts, Nancy Sorden, Themba Tshibanda, Andrea Turner, Maskeelah-Myrtle Washington
Abstain: Bill Crosier, Akio Tanaka
[10Y – 10N- 2A: Chair’s ruling sustained]

Bill Campisi ask that Mansoor Sabbagh be recused from the vote.
Chair rules that Mansoor Sabbagh be recused from the vote.

Motion by Grace Aaron, seconded by Bill Campisi.
“The vote to uphold the Chair on the Point of Order be retaken since the rule for voting was changed after the vote.”

Motion to Adjourn
Vote on the Adjournment:
Yes: Jim Brown, Adriana Casenave, Benito Diaz, Cerene Roberts, Nancy Sorden, Themba Tshibanda, Maskeelah-Myrtle Washington
No: Grace Aaron, Jonathan Alexander, David Beaton, Bill Campisi, Bill Crosier, Kathryn Davis, Rhonda Garner, Jan Goodman, Sabrina Jacobs, Ken Laufer, Robert Mark, Mansoor Sabbagh, Alex Steinberg, Akio Tanaka,
Not Voting: Andrea Turner,
[7Y – 14N- 1NV: Motion fails]

Substitute Motion by Grace Aaron, seconded by Akio Tanaka:
“As the roll call vote on the ruling of the Chair regarding Mansoor replacing Sharon Brown was flawed as a ruling that Mr. Sabbagh could not vote was decided AFTER he voted, therefore be it moved that the entire vote on this point of order be re taken as the first order of business in the next Open meeting.”

Motion to Adjourn:
Vote on the Adjournment
Yes: Jim Brown, Bill Campisi Adriana Casenave, Benito Diaz, Sabrina Jacobs, Cerene Roberts, Nancy Sorden, Themba Tshibanda, Maskeelah-Myrtle Washington
No: Grace Aaron, David Beaton, Bill Campisi, Bill Crosier, Kathryn Davis, Jan Goodman, Ken Laufer, Robert Mark, Mansoor Sabbagh, Alex Steinberg, Akio Tanaka,
PNV: Jonathan Alexander
NV: Rhonda Garner, Andrea Turner,
[9Y- 10N- 1PNV – 2NV: Motion fails]

Vote on the Substitute Motion:
Yes: Grace Aaron, Jonathan Alexander, David Beaton, Bill Crosier, Kathryn Davis, Jan Goodman, Sabrina Jacobs, Ken Laufer, Robert Mark, Mansoor Sabbagh, Alex Steinberg, Akio Tanaka
No: Jim Brown, Adriana Casenave, Benito Diaz, Cerene Roberts, Nancy Sorden, Themba Tshibanda, Maskeelah-Myrtle Washington
Abstain: Bill Campisi
NV: Rhonda Garner, Andrea Turner,
[12Y- 7N- 1A - 2NV: Motion Passes]

VI. Adjourn

Adjourned without objection.

Akio Tanaka – 02/21/17
PNB Secretary